

TEMPE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Ira Bennett, Vice Chair Anne Bilsbarrow Brad Graham Andrea Gregory, Chair Charlie Lee Brenda Shears Scott Solliday Korri Turner

TEMPE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE

Amy Douglass Alyssa Gerszewski Nathan Hallam Wm. "Billy" Kiser Alyssa Matter Joe Nucci Jared Smith Mark Vinson

The City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government, in association with the United States Department of the Interior / National Park Service

Tempe Historic
Preservation Office
Community Development
Department
21 East 6th Street, Suite 208
P.O. Box 5002
Tempe, AZ 85280

480.350.8028 8579 FAX; 8913TDD



Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Date: THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 1, 2012

Location: Hatton Hall 34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners Present: Anne Bilsbarrow, Andrea Gregory, Brenda

Shears, Korri Turner

Staff Present: Amy Douglass, Alyssa Gerszewski, Nathan Hallam,

Billy Kiser, Alyssa Matter, Joe Nucci,

Public Present: Xinggu Chen, Michael Jarmer, Jorge Garcia,

Hugh Hallman, Vic Linoff, Patricia Olson,

Jennifer Pankratz, Yefei Shen, Yi Wang, Yanyan

Zhang

Call to Order: 6:05 P.M., Andrea Gregory, Chair

1. Call to Audience NO REPLY

2. Approval of HPC Minutes 10/11/2012 Tempe HPC meeting

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: MOVE TO APPROVE TEMPE HPC MEETING MINUTES FROM 10/11/2012. SECOND [TURNER]. APPROVED, 4-0.

5. Presentation Arizona State University Update

Presentation by Patricia Olson

- Gammage Auditorium: loading dock has been completed after five years of construction; original quartz from façade has been stored on ASU Polytechnic Campus for possible future reuse; possible restroom addition in future will impact façade; possible future rehabilitation of the two exterior bridges; possible deferred maintenance project; 50 year anniversary will be in 2014
- Harrington-Birchett House: will be used in conjunction with ASU Block 12 development; proposal to use as dining venue; proposed plan would restore exterior and include outdoor dining; new ASU university architect is working with the design school on rehabilitation
- Piper Writers House: Interior rehabilitation ongoing, planned completion in January 2013
- University Club: Ryden Architects currently conducting building assessment to determine necessary rehabilitation work
- Art Annex: under consideration for rehabilitation for use as a restaurant in conjunction with Block 12 development
- Social Science Building: interior rehabilitation ongoing
- Manzanita Hall: Currently in construction phase; complete interior demolition has been completed
- Archaeology: several monitoring investigations underway at various construction sites; nothing to report on significant discoveries
- MPDF Forms: Approval received to hire an historian for document preparation
- Nucci: Invites ASU Historic Preservation to take part in 2013 Arizona Preservation Conference to be held in Mesa; Olson expresses interest

3. Public Hearing Historic Eligible Classification

Nucci: Explanation of Historic Eligible classification

Gregory: Has heard that the Scudder Rental House is deteriorating. Is this true?

Nucci: the property is currently undergoing interior restoration, but no work being done on exterior. Property owner has indicated an interest in listing on THPR.

Hallam: If the property is listed on THPR, the name will change, because new research has shown that B.H. Scudder had no affiliation with the house.

Public Comment: Steve Tseffos, 6131 E. Calle Rosa, Scottsdale, AZ

- Is attending in protest of HE classification of Mullen-Van Petten House at 918 S. Mill Ave. (hereafter referred to as MVP House)
- Believes HE process is confrontational to property owners and represents a departure from Tempe historic preservation precedent; this stance counteracts the actions of historic preservation commissions/offices elsewhere
- Believes that the public voice is not being heard by HPO and HPC
- Is currently working with SHPO and NPS to remove MVP House from listing on the National Register of Historic Places
- Asks that HPC take no further action towards this property

4. Discuss & Consider Mill Properties New Ownership and Eventually RedevelopmentPresentation by Property Owner Steve Tseffos

- Personal biography, overview of his history living in Tempe and acquiring local properties
- Has worked on rehabilitation of many historic properties in the past
- Owns more Maple-Ash properties than any other single property owner
- Overview of other Tempe historic properties he owns
- Ownership history of the five Mill Avenue properties in question (910, 918, 928, 930, 944 S. Mill Ave.)
- Tseffos acquired these properties in 1996 and has owned them since then, adaptively reusing them for commercial purposes
- Refutes recent newspaper story about a change in ownership in these properties. In fact, there has been no such change. Tseffos recently changed partners, but he remains an owner
- Tseffos provides his vision for historic preservation, which involves relocating endangered historic properties rather than demolition
- Encourages HPC to consider making this a recommended approach for preservation
- Relocation and adaptive reuse makes historic buildings more accessible to the public
- States that no other entity has destroyed more historic buildings in Tempe than the City of Tempe itself
- Currently has no plans to relocate, demolish, or otherwise redevelop the five Mill Avenue properties in question
- If these properties are ever removed, they could be relocated to form another Old Town Square-type compound
- Stresses importance of public-private partnership in such ventures as relocating historic buildings
- City of Tempe has denied his request for a letter of support for de-listing this property from the National Register of Historic Places

Dialogue between Tseffos and HPC

- Q: If the properties are moved, would they be moved elsewhere within Maple-Ash?

- A: Possibly, but it would be impossible to place them contiguously and they would have to be placed separately as space would permit.
- Bilsbarrow: HPC and Tseffos have difference in interpretation. Why would HE listing require HPC to be confrontational? Is HPC advice so terrible?

 Tseffos: Confrontation lies in the imposition upon a property owner of something that is not wanted. Why does the property require HE designation? HE is nothing more than a stepping stone for future historic designation.
- Shears: Believes HE to be a proactive approach, not a confrontational one
- Nucci: HPC will not list any property on THPR without owner consent; however, owner consent is not required for classification as HE
- Nucci: HPC has never imposed listing on the local register upon a property owner without consent
- Comparisons made to recent situation with the David Wright House in the City of Phoenix
- Gregory: HE designation designed to ensure that HPC is aware of any future development proposals
- Tseffos: If HPC insists on classifying his property as HE, he will appeal to City Council
- Q: What constraint does HE place on a property owner?
 - A: The singular effect is to potentially delay demolition permit for up to 30 days
- Tseffos: Tempe needs a process in place for relocating historic buildings
- Q: With the property listed on the National Register, what are the constraints?
 A: (Tseffos) Constraints are irrelevant. He is de-listing the property and is doing so because he wants to. Does not believe pride in ownership is contingent upon listing on an historic registry
- Q: Does relocation of a property require a demolition permit?
 - A: No.
- Q: Is this the first time HE classification has been disputed?
 - A: Yes.

End of Steve Tseffos Presentation and Dialogue with HPC

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CLASSIFY THE HUGH LAIRD HOUSE AS HISTORIC ELIGIBLE AND LIST AS SUCH IN THE RECORDS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. SECOND [TURNER]. APPROVED: 4-0.

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CLASSIFY THE MORROW-HUDSON HOUSE AS HISTORIC ELIGIBLE AND LIST IT AS SUCH IN THE RECORDS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. SECOND [SHEARS]. APPROVED: 4-0.

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CLASSIFY THE BYRON REDDEN HOUSE AS HISTORIC ELIGIBLE AND LIST IT AS SUCH IN THE RECORDS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. SECOND [TURNER]. APPROVED: 4-0.

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CLASSIFY THE LOWELL REDDEN HOUSE AS HISTORIC ELIGIBLE AND LIST IT AS SUCH IN THE RECORDS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. SECOND [SHEARS]. APPROVED: 4-0.

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CLASSIFY THE B.H. SCUDDER RENTAL HOUSE AS HISTORIC ELIGIBLE AND LIST IT AS SUCH IN THE RECORDS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. SECOND [TURNER]. APPROVED: 4-0.

MOTION [BILSBARROW]: THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CLASSIFY THE MULLEN-VAN PETTEN HOUSE AS HISTORIC ELIGIBLE AND LIST IT AS SUCH IN THE RECORDS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT. SECOND [NO SECOND RECEIVED]. MOTION FAILS.

6. Discuss & Consider Commission/Council Liaison Assignments

- Nucci: Recognizes former Mayor Hugh Hallman in the audience.
- Bilsbarrow met with Councilmember Corey Woods
- Shears met with Shana Ellis; Ellis expressed willingness to talk with HPC about proposed Mill Avenue streetcar development
- Turner & Gregory have meetings scheduled with respective councilmembers

7. Hayden Flour Mill & Silo Activities

- Tours scheduled for Saturday, November 3rd, from 9 a.m. to 12 noon.
- Nucci: Expresses need for additional tour guides
- Currently about 400 people on waiting list for tours
- Diabetes Walk on Saturday morning at Tempe Town Lake likely to yield walk-up participants
- Mill was removed from the November 1 City Council meeting agenda
- There are many questions among council members regarding historic designation of the mill that need to be answered before it can be heard at City Council meeting
- HPO has been directed to proceed as follows: prepare an informational summary for City Manager Charlie Meyer; then an Issue Review Session will be held between HPO and council members; then possible scheduling on a future City Council meeting agenda

8. Discuss and Consider Tempe General Plan 2040 Update

- Hallam: Continuing work with GIS mapping of historic Tempe subdivisions
- Hallam: Working on identifying about 65 specific single-family subdivisions to be reviewed during an upcoming driving tour
- Hallam: Brad Graham's criteria for evaluation is being taken into consideration throughout this process
- Hallam: Hopes to eventually narrow down the list to a select few to be chosen as cultural resource areas in GP2040
- Nucci: Discussion of current Historic Preservation Plan
- Nucci: Proposes reexamination and revision of current Historic Preservation Plan for inclusion in GP2040.
- Possibility of accounting for Steve Tseffos suggestion regarding advocacy for historic property relocation when necessary, to be included in amended Historic Preservation Plan
- Nucci: Asks commission members to review current Plan and prepare comments and recommendations for changes to December HPC meeting
- Hallam: Clarification of Cultural Resource Area (CRA) meaning: defines these as being crucial to the preservation of character and as a tool for preserving density, a pivotal qualitative attribute of CRAs.
- Nucci: Additional discussion of density within CRAs; CRA concept should be considered with more precision in the future

9. Discuss and Consider Graduate Student Intern Program Projects

- Gerszewski: Work with multi-family subdivisions ongoing, but primary focus has been with single-family subdivisions
- Gerszewski: Moeur Park NRN will be completed in December and should be listed on the March 2013 HSRC meeting agenda for review

Gregory: Moeur Park NRN should include historic context on highways

- Nucci: Three Tempe properties slated for review at November 16 HSRC meeting in Phoenix: Tempe Double Butte Cemetery; Tempe Municipal Building; and Kirkland-McKinney Ditch
- Nucci: anticipates HSRC resistance on Municipal Building NRN due to mid-century-modern architecture
- Hallam: Working on Farmer Addition Survey & Inventory (about 10 properties) and hopes to eventually bring this district as HE
- Hallam & Nucci: HE properties to be heard at December HPC meeting will once again include Steve Tseffos-owned properties
- Discussion: Should these properties be removed from consideration for HE? HPC just established precedent that it will not classify Tseffos properties as HE.
- The Tseffos properties will remain on the December HPC agenda for HE classification

10. Discuss and Consider Chair/Staff Updates

Gregory: Upcoming coalition meeting of local historic preservation commissions (Nov. 20)

11. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items

Next HPC Meeting Date: Thursday 12/13/2012 6:00 p.m. at Hatton Hall, 34 E. 7th Street

Adjourned: 7:55 PM

Andrea Gregory, Chair

-minutes scheduled for HPC approval on 12/13/2012

FREOUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

- CDD City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley the CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.
- CLG Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.
- DDA Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.
- DSD City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning
- DRC City of Tempe Development Review Commission: volunteer board advising Mayor and Council on matters related to the built environment and administration of General Plan 2030 and the Zoning and Development Code.
- GRIC Gila River Indian Community: is an alliance of two tribes, the Akimel O'odham (Pima) and the Pee Posh (Maricopa). Established by Executive Order in 1859, the Community covers more than 600 square miles and is the largest indigenous community in the Phoenix metropolitan area. GRIC helps make the Tempe Preservation Graduate Student Intern Program possible through a generous grant of State-Shared Revenue funds.
- HPF (see Tempe HPF) Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation
- HSRC (Arizona) Historic Sites Review Committee: Arizona's official Arizona and National Register of Historic Places review board. The HSRC meets three times during the year to review National Register nominations and advise the State Historic Preservation Officer on nominations to the State and National Registers.
- IEBC International Existing Building Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.
- IRS Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the "Call to the Audience" prior to regular Council meetings.
- NPS National Park Service: the City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government through an inter-governmental agreement with the United States Department of the Interior National Park Service and the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office.
- NRN National Register Nomination: An application to list a property on the National Register of Historic Places is reviewed by the SHPO and then by the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (Sites) before formal application is made to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington DC.
- PAD Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.
- SHPO State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona's prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.
- SRP-MIC Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.
- Tempe HPC Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation
- Tempe HPF Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation: A private nonprofit corporation established in 2005, Mission Statement 02.02.06 "The Foundation advocates preserving Tempe's at-risk historic properties and supporting worthy preservation projects through education, community participation, and fundraising."
- Tempe HPO Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe's prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.
- THM Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe's past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe's history within the context of state and national events.
- TOD Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community's focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.
- ZDC Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and developme